DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 040 412 CG 005 397

AUTHOR Thompson, Donald L.; Tseng, M. S.
TITLE Counseled vs. Non-Counseled One Year Later.
INSTITUTION West Virginia Univ., Morgantown.
PUB DATE [70]
NOTE 7p.

EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF-$0.25 HC-$0.45
DESCRIPTORS Adolescents, *Counseling, *Counseling Effectiveness, *Followup Studies, Guidance, Guidance Counseling, *Guidance Programs, *Individual Characteristics, Students

ABSTRACT

This report is a followup evaluation of a study on differences between adolescents who seek counseling and those who do not. The primary purpose of this followup study was to determine if the differences found in the original study continue to exist and also to determine if any discernable effects of counseling could be found. Subjects were divided into three groups: C1 (those who sought counseling from the first study); C2 (those who sought counseling after the first study); and NC (those from the first study who had not sought counseling). Several tests were administered, including: (1) the North-Hatt Occupational Prestige Scale; (2) Rosenberg's Self-Esteem Scale; and (3) McClelland's Achievement Thematic Apperception Test. Findings suggest several possibilities. Since C2 showed the greatest change, perhaps the initial impact of counseling is the greatest in producing change. Group C1 showed little change on any of the variables. Group NC showed no significant changes on any of the variables. (KJ)

PRINTED BY THE STANDARD REGISTER COMPANY, U. S. A.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

ED 040412

COUNSELED VS. NON-COUNSELED ONE YEAR LATER

Donald L. Thompson and M. S. Tseng
West Virginia University

The following paper is a report of the follow-up evaluation of a study reported in the December 1968 issue of the Personnel and Guidance Journal, titled "Differences Between Adolescents Who Seek Counseling and Those Who Do Not" by Michael Tseng and Donald L. Thompson. In the original study,

"it was hypothesized that students who seek counseling for occupational and educational planning would differ from those who do not seek counseling in terms of socioeconomic background, certain personality variables, vocational development, and relations with parents. A battery of tests and a questionnaire were given to 245 male students from McDowell County, West Virginia. Of this group, 93 had received counseling (designated as Group C) and 152 had not received counseling (designated as Group NC). Group C showed a higher socioeconomic background, more in Achievement, and more certainty in vocational planning. The two groups did not differ significantly in occupational aspiration, perception of occupational prestige, self-esteem, fear of failure, relations with parents, and certainty in educational planning."

The primary purpose of this follow-up study was to determine if the differences continued to exist that were found in the original study, and also to determine if any discernable effects of counseling could be determined. For the follow-up research, it was necessary to designate three groups. This became necessary because during the period from May 1967 when the original study was conducted, to May 1968 when the follow-up was conducted, a percentage of the original NC group had voluntarily sought counseling. Therefore, in this report the three designated groups will be as follows: C^1 (those students who had sought counseling prior to May 1967), C^2 (those students who were in the original NC group, but had sought counseling prior to May 1968), and NC (those students who were in the

CG 005 397

original NC group and had not sought counseling as of May 1968). In terms of the hypotheses for the follow-up study it must be noted that the question studied herein is completely different from the question asked in the original study. In the original study the purpose was to determine differences not attributable to counseling. In the follow-up research it was hypothesized that differences in personality and vocational development variables between seekers and non-seekers would be accentuated as a result of counseling. It must be noted that there was no effort made to determine the quality or quantity of counseling received.

METHODS

Subjects

The population for the original study was defined as all ninth, tenth, eleventh, and twelfth grade male students who were still in school as well as male dropouts who left school during the school year 1966-67 and were permanent residents of McDowell County, West Virginia. The subjects were selected at random prior to conducting the research. The population was identified by county records, school records, and employment service records. The population for this research consists of 5,600 persons. The total sample size was 245 respondents; 93 had received counseling (designated as C), while 152 had not received counseling (designated as NC).

In the follow-up study, an attempt was made to re-survey as many of the original subjects as possible. Of the original 93 S's in group C, 45 S's could be located for the follow-up, (designated for the follow-up as C^1). Of the 152 S's of group NC, 90 S's were contacted. Of these 90 S's, 39 had sought counseling during the intervening year (this group of S's was designated as C^2 for the follow-up study). The remaining 51 S's had not sought counseling before the time of either survey (this group was designated again as NC).

Instruments

The instruments used for the follow-up study were the same as those used in the original study. These were a questionnaire which collected information concerning the S's age, race, grade level, father's and mother's educational level, father's occupation, and perceived parental attitudes toward education and occupations; the North-Hatt Occupational Prestige Scale (OPS); Haller's Occupational Aspiration Scale (OAS); Rosenberg's Self-Esteem Scale (SES); McClelland's Achievement Thematic Apperception Test (TAT); and Mandler-Cowen's Test Anxiety Questionnaire for High School Students (TAQ).

The OPS consisted of 20 occupations which were selected from the list of 90 used in the National Opinion Research Center study (1947). Students were instructed to rank these 20 occupations on the basis of prestige. Scoring was done by finding the difference between the rank provided by the Scale and the Rank assigned by the Student, and adding these discrepancy scores for all the 20 occupations.

The OAS (Haller and Miller, 1967) is an eight-item multiple-choice instrument designed primarily for use among male high school students. The total score is interpreted as a relative indicator of the prestige level on the occupational hierarchy which an individual views as a goal. The reliability of this scale is reported to be about .80.

The SES (Rosenberg, 1965) is a 10-item Guttman scale with a reported reproducibility of 93 percent and scaleability (items) of 73 percent. High self-esteem reflects self-respect, self-satisfaction, self-content, where as low self-esteem implies self-rejection and self-dissatisfaction.

The TAT, as used in this study, consisted of four pictures (Atkinson, 1958) presented in a neutral classroom situation. Scoring was done by two trained graduate students with inter-rater reliability of .90. In order to

facilitate the treatment of data a constant of 5 was added to each raw score.

A short form of TAQ (Mandler and Cowan, 1958) was used, which consisted of 32 items and which correlated .946 with the 48-item long form. Each item was graded on a 9-point scale with one representing low anxiety level and 9 representing high anxiety level.

Results

T-tests for correlated data were carried out for each of the three groups (C^1, C^2, NC) on 5 dependent variables. The analysis considered only the degree of change which occurred during the interviewing year, as groups were compared with themselves and not with each others. Mean scores and resultant t values are summarized in Table 1.

Insert Table 1

Subjects in group C^1 had a mean score of 79.9 on the North-Hatte scale, (perception of occupational prestige, OPS) in 1967. In 1968 C^1 had a mean score of 65.8 on this variable (Note: The decrease in score indicates that the group's perception of the occupational prestige hierarchy now shows less deviation from a national normative standpoint). The mean change is 14.1 which is statistically significant at the .05 level. Group C^2 had an OPS mean score of 84.1 in 1967, and 70.3 in 1968. The mean difference here is 13.8 which is also statistically significant at the .05 level. Group NC had an OPS mean score of 92.0 in 1967 and 81.6 in 1968, with a mean difference of 10.4. This finding was not significant at the .05 level.

Group C^1 showed no significant changes on the other variables from 1967 to 1968. Group C^2 changed significantly on two additional variables between 1967 and 1968. In 1967, C^2 had a mean score of 153.3 on the TAQ (fear of failure), while in 1968 the mean score had dropped to 144.4. This

mean change is statistically significant at the .05 level and indicates an appreciable decrease in fear of failure. Group C^2 also made a significant change in level of occupational aspiration (as measured by expressed occupational choice, coded by DOT one-digit classification). In 1967, C^2 had a mean score of 6.0, while in 1968 the mean score had changed to 5.1 representing a mean change of 9.1. Those familiar with the D.O.T. classification system will recognize that the shift was in the direction of higher level occupations. This mean change is significant at the .05 level.

In reviewing Table 1 it will be noted that Group NC showed no significant changes on any of the variables studied.

DISCUSSION

The findings suggest several possibilities. First, it would seem that the initial impact of counseling is the most profound in producing change with the effects tapering off over time. This is suggested by the greater degree of change found in C^2 rather than C^1. It must be noted here that C^2 had sought counseling after the pre-test and preceding the post-test, while C^1 had sought counseling prior to pre-testing.

However, one caution must be made. Certainly the data cannot be said to prove conclusively the inevitable "good" of counseling. It was found in the original study that counseling attracts students who generally have the lesser need for counseling. It might be hypothesized here that students who seek counseling are also more flexible in terms of selecting alternatives and are more amenable to change, exclusive of the counseling process. Again, the question of nature (inherent personality and socio-economic factors) versus nurture (counseling) is raised, and unfortunately this data cannot assume to answer that question.

REFERENCES

Atkinson, J. W. Motives in fantasy, action, and society: a method of assessment and study. Princeton: Van Nostrand, 1958.

Haller, A. O., & Miller, I. W. The occupational aspiration scale theory, structure and correlates. Madison: Department of Rural Sociology, University of Wisconsin, 1967.

Mandler, G., & Cowan, J. Test anxiety questionnaires. Journal of Consulting Psychology, 1958, 22, 228-229.

National Opinion Research Center. Jobs and occupations: a popular evaluation. Opinion News, 1947, 9. 3-13.

Tseng, Michael & Thompson, Donald L. "Differences Between Adolescents Who Seek Counseling and Those Who Do Not," Personnel and Guidance Journal, Vol. 47, December, 1968.

TABLE I

COMPARISONS OF C^1, C^2, AND NC GROUPS ON FIVE DEPENDENT MEASURES - 1967 VS. 1968 DATA

Variable	Group	Year 1967	1968	t
OP	C^1	79.9	65.8	2.4321*
	C^2	84.1	70.3	2.1032*
	NC	92.0	81.6	1.9401
TAQ	C^1	157.0	155.8	0.9361
	C^2	153.3	144.4	2.1649*
	NC	159.1	157.4	0.9848
Occ Choice (DOT)	C^1	6.2	6.4	1.3497
	C^2	6.0	5.1	2.0991*
	NC	7.2	7.0	0.7084
OAS	C^1	42.3	42.6	0.8469
	C^2	41.1	42.8	1.8691
	NC	39.3	39.2	0.7468
TAT	C^1	11.7	10.5	1.6004
	C^2	10.2	10.2	0.4331
	NC	9.2	8.5	1.8492

* $p < .05$